

Reviews

Celil Ender. Karesi, Saruhan, Aydin ve Mentese Beylikleri Paralari (Nümismatik Yayinlari No.2)

Garokurkman and Celil Ender. Coins of the Fourteenth Century Aegean Anatolian Begliks: 700-829AH / 1300-1425 AD (Ege Beylikleri Sikkeleri - 14 yüzyil - Karesi, Saruhan, Aydin, Mentese Beylikleri)

Celil Ender, *Karesi, Saruhan, Aydin ve Mentese Beylikleri Paralari (Nümismatik Yayinlari No.2)* Turkish text, 224 pages, map and bibliography, 19 plates of coin photos. With 6 colour plates of monuments, mosques and inscriptions. The catalogue portion, profusely illustrated by accurate line drawings. Card covers, 6^{1/2} x 9 inches. ISBN 975-93806-0-9. Published by the author, Istanbul, 2000 (Posta Abone Kutusu 76,81062 Erenkoy, Istanbul, Turkey).

Garokurkman and Celil Ender, *Coins of the Fourteenth Century Aegean Anatolian Begliks: 700-829AH / 1300-1425 AD (Ege Beylikleri Sikkeleri - 14 yüzyil - Karesi, Saruhan, Aydin, Mentese Beylikleri)* Text in Turkish and English, 254 pages, bibliography, 28 plates of coin photos in enlargement. Catalogue portion illustrated with hundreds of enlarged line drawings. Well bound, 8 x 11^{1/2} inches. Published by Kurkman in a limited edition, Istanbul, 1998; released in April 2001 by the author (P.K.121, Tesvikiye, 80212, Istanbul, Turkey).

Two acknowledged Turkish experts on Islamic coinage collaborated in the past decade to write an up-to-date history of the four Anatolian Turkish principalities and describe as many of the coins attributed to the Karasi, Sarukhan, Aydin and Mentese beyliks examined in museums in London, Berlin, Rome, Paris, Oxford, New York, Washington DC, Tübingen and Graz, as well as the important collections in Turkey (Bursa, Ephesus, Istanbul, Manisa, Milas, Odemis and Tire) plus specimens from the collections of Etker, Olcer, Kabaklarli, Yardas, YapiKredi, Erel, Sengun, Webdale, Erek and the authors themselves. In both editions the two pages of abbreviations are included which show the initials of the source collections of the coins catalogued. Ender, however, has omitted 97 of the collectors' own numbers which fortunately are printed in Kurkman's volume. It is of interest to realise that approximately half of the coins catalogued were once in the collections of two numismatists: Webdale and Olcer.

The publication of their work was first announced for release by EREN in Istanbul but was cancelled after there was an abrupt termination of the authors' joint venture in 1998. Fortunately, the major part of the work had been completed and one of the authors, Celil Ender, published his copy of the manuscript in Turkish in July 2000 and added a few coins he had discovered later. The fact that he had unfortunately omitted the name of his co-author, Garokurkman, resulted in the publication of a limited but superior edition of the work with both of the authors' names mentioned, with an English translation included, with all the line drawings (Mr Kurkman's work) and enlarged coin photos. This edition was released in Istanbul in April this year, but bears the date of 1998 on the title page, although his preface is dated September 2000. This means that the work is essentially the same in both volumes, the text and catalogue portions being well organised as follows:

KARASI BEYLIK: 697-761 / 1297-1360: The two pages of text provided by the authors mention the fact that the history of this beylik is derived from contradictory

accounts and from the tombstones in the Tokat Museum. The best account is Elizabeth A. Zachariadou's article in the 1991 Symposium volume ("Halcyon days in Crete I") 1993. In the catalogue section there are descriptions of six coins minted in the name of the Ilkhanid ruler, Uljaitu, followed by 22 coins struck in silver and copper by Demirhan Beg in Balikesir and Yahsi Han Beg and Beylerbegi Celebi, who ruled in Bergama.

SARUKHAN BEYLIK: 700-814 / 1300-1411: Three pages are devoted to the history of this beylik. The contribution by Zachariadou in the *Encyclopedia of Islam*, 1995, is a necessary source for further study especially since the authors raise the question of the death of Ishak Beg and which of the two sons succeeded him. Moreover, the evidence of recently discovered copper coins dated 814 shows that Ishak Beg had another son named Sarhan, which Kurkman discussed in an article in the *Turkish Numismatic Society Bulletin*, 1986. The genealogical table of the rulers of the beyliks shows a serial number beside the name which relates to the catalogue portion. This makes it very easy to refer to the pages and find the coins for each ruler. No coins have been found belonging to Saruhan Beg and his successor, Ilyas Beg, and it is pointed out that the coin Erel attributed to Ilyas was an error for a coin of Leys Beg, the last Mentеше ruler. Ishak Beg coins without dates, similar to Ilkhanid types, total nine. There are two with the word sultan. Those dated 776 and with the earliest known tughra device total 11, of which four are illustrated. There are 13 with halledehu / ishak on the obverse and hallada allahu / mulkehu on the reverse and a metrological list. The next ruler, Hizir Shah Beg, is represented by 8 silver coins and a similar number of copper coins. For Orhan Beg 4 silver coins with a tughra device on the obverse and dated 807 are shown. These were well discussed by K. Zhukov in the *Rethymon Symposium volume*, 1993, and are followed by 13 copper coins dated 806 and 807. Two recently found copper coins dated 814 provide evidence of the existence of the second Saruhan Beg's rule. Six coins of Ishak Beg II are described and two copper coin types illustrated. (An unpublished paper by Zhukov read at a conference in Cesme, 1997, discussed these interesting coins in detail). The catalogue portion of the Sarukhan coins concludes with 22 anonymous copper coins of three types. There are many such coins in the museums of the Aegean region. They are difficult to assign to the beyliks covered in the present study and only a limited selection has been made.

AYDIN BEYLIK: 707-829 / 1307-1426: There are 11 pages devoted to the history of this important beylik, which has been well covered by Uzuncarsili in his *Anadolu Beylikleri* (pages 104-20) and by Melikoff in the *Encyclopedia of Islam*. The present authors have included the full text of the early treaty between Giovanni Sanudo, Duke of Candia, and Hizir Celebi, the Emir of Aydin, 9 May 1337. They point out that it is curious that such a treaty should have been signed by a lower ranking emir than Umur Beg during his lifetime (one of the great Turkish naval commanders), his brother being a far less capable leader. When Sultan Bayezid led his armies against the principalities, Isa Beg pledged his allegiance but he was forced to live in Tire by the Ottoman sultan, which resulted in the beylik going into abeyance for 15 years. After the battle of Ankara, the beylik was restored by Timur under Isa Beg's sons, Musa and Umur. The authors agree that much more remains to be discovered about the history of this principality. They add that, on the evidence of the coinage, Umur Beg II had a son named Mehmed.

The catalogue section is organised as follows. Two coins are listed for Ibrahim Bahadur Beg, the third son of Mehmed Beg, the founder of the dynasty. One coin is described of Suleyman Sah Beg, one of the five sons of Mehmed Beg, who received the lands around Tire. Fahreddin Isa Beg, the fifth and youngest son of Mehmed Beg, remained with this father in Birgi. More of his coins exist than for any of the other Aydin emirs. The catalogue shows several types: 18 coins with a square cartouche on the obverse, three with a double ring intersected by the "knot of bliss" motif, two with the names of the four caliphs around the Kalima, one with the names around a hexagon. There are also two coins with the mint-name of Ayaslug. One silver coin is attributed to Musa Beg, who may have fought with Timur at Ankara, but nothing is known about his brief reign. There is an interesting commentary on Mehmed Beg II, who ruled from 807 / 1406 (?) and 10 dated and undated copper coins are attributed to him. These are followed by the coins of Mustafa Beg. There are two silver ones dated 834 expressing allegiance to the Karaman sultan, Mehmed Beg II, and two in his own name. These latter were once attributed to the Ottoman ruler, Mustafa Sehzade (Kucuk). Fifteen pages of this catalogue section cover the copper and small number of silver coins of this Beylik which lack either the ruler's name or mint. In the Aydin genealogical table, Cuneyd Beg is listed as the son of Ibrahim Bahadur (son of Mehmed Beg). A separate two-page history is devoted to this intriguing person, who was a member of the Aydinoghullari dynasty and not an outsider. This only emerged from examination of the vakf records and the evidence of the coins. He had three reigns: 866-9 (1403-6), 813-6 (1410-13), 825-9 (1422-6). During the struggle between the Ottoman princes for the accession (i.e. the interregnum period), Cuneyd Beg backed Isa Beg against Mehmed Celebi. When Mehmed defeated Isa, Cuneyd asked for a pardon and swore allegiance to Mehmed Celebi, who granted him the title Aydin Begligi. Two types of coins of Cuneyd are described and illustrated, the first with a confused and semi-literate declaration of faith and the names of the four caliphs around. Three specimens are shown. The reverse is divided into four segments with mehmed (b...) bayezid in the upper segment, ghazi cuneyd in the lower segment, hallada at the right, and mulkehu at the left. Turkish written sources report that Mehmed Celebi forced Cuneyd Beg to recognise his suzerainty and his right to strike coins (Mordtmann in EI). The second type, of which 9 examples are described, has the ruler's tughra on the obverse.

MENTESE BEYLIK: 700-829 / 1300-1435: The history of the Mentese-Oghullari has been studied by many scholars, with P. Wittek's "Das Furstentum Mentese", 1934, reprinted in Turkish translation after 1944, and E. Mercil later (1991) article in EI both being standard references. The authors have made good use of them and give the details of the treaty concluded between the Duke of Candia, Morosini, and the Emir Orhan (13 April 1331). After the death of Ibrahim Beg, the beylik was split into three. Musa took Balat and Milas, Ahmed Gazi became ruler of Fethiye, and Mehmet Beg ruler of Mugla and Cine. This period is well covered in the text. Ender's Turkish edition includes a genealogical table, but this was omitted in error from Kurkman's superior publication. The first coins were struck during the reign of Masud Beg in 702 in Milas, in the name of the Seljuk sultan, Masud II, as recorded by J.C. Hinrichs in his study of the Seljuks (1990). Three specimens are listed in the catalogue. Thereafter, coins of the three sons were struck and examples of these are described. Three types of silver coins of Ahmed Gazi are represented as are undated copper coins. Coins of the next ruler, Ilyas Beg, are discussed - 16 silver coins minted in 805 and 10 without date. Six more silver coins and two half-denomination coins, dated

818, demonstrate that he paid allegiance to the Ottoman sultan, Mehmed Celebi. Coins of the last ruler, Leys (Uveys), the son of Ilyas Beg, are represented by two undated silver coins and 14 akches and half akches dated 823, 824 and 825. Finally the authors have added four silver coins which they state are probably struck by Ahmed Beg II (823-7), the other son of Ilyas Beg.

GIGLIATI-TYPE SILVER COINS: In Kurkman's edition of the work there is a three-part survey of the gigliati type coins struck by the Latin colony, the first being those struck during the first half of the 14th century AD. These were the founding years of the Sarukhan beylik in which there were no coins either in the name of the Ilkhanids or of the Islamic type. This may have encouraged the striking of gigliati-type coins. Schlumberger's explanation of these coins is included, and the only coins catalogued are also taken from his work (reprinted in Graz in 1954) and show the mint of Manglasi. The second part concerns the imitations of the gigliati struck in Naples around 1300 AD which were assumed to have been struck by the Sarukhan and Mentese beyliks. The authors point out that errors occurred in the writings of P. Lambros in which Magnesia de Spil was confused with Magnesie de Meandre, near Ephesus, which was part of the Sarukhan beylik. They also mention the erroneous attribution of such coins to Umur Beg by such eminent numismatists as Karabecek and referred to by Uzuncarsili in his *Anadolu Beylikleri* (page 119) and Ibrahim Artuk (no. 1486 in his Istanbul catalogue). Sixteen silver and one gold coin (not in Schlumberger) are listed here from the mint of Theologos. The last part of this section is devoted to the silver gigliati-type coins struck by the Latin Colony during the time of Sucuaddin Orhan Beg (720-45 / 1320-45) of the Mentese beylik. It is the firm view of both authors that none of these gigliati type coins were struck by the beyliks. In fact, Mr Ender assumes that they were illegally minted by the Venetian and Genoese merchants in their own mints set up in Miletos and Agios Theologos (Ayasluk).

One of the features of the Ender edition is a six-page coloured supplement, with 14 photos of monuments and inscribed stonework, and mosques relevant to the history as outlined in the text. Some of these appear in the Kurkman volume in black and white on the appropriate pages of Aydin and Mentese history. In both volumes, the photos of the coins are extremely well printed and excellent for study along with the superb line drawings.

This reviewer has no hesitation in recommending the purchase of one or both volumes by historians and numismatists interested in the subject since the work is unlikely to be superseded for some time, perhaps only when Dr Konstantin Zhukov publishes the revised edition of his *Egeiskii Emirati v. xiv-xv* (The Aegean Emirates in the 14th and 15th centuries), Moscow 1988, which he is currently working on.

Kenneth M. MacKenzie

Parmeshwari Lal Gupta. Paper Money of India
Kishore Jhunjunwalla. The Standard Reference Guide to Indian Paper Money

Parmeshwari Lal Gupta, *Paper Money of India* published by Kishore Jhunjunwalla, Currencies and Coins, 53 The Arcade, World Trade Centre, Cuffe Parade, Mumbai, 400005, India, 2000, 112 + 464 pages, ISBN 81-901068-0-5, \$100

Kishore Jhunjunwalla (Academic Consultant and Editor, Shailendra Bhandare), *The Standard Reference Guide to Indian Paper Money*, Kishore Jhunjunwalla, Currencies and Coins, 53 The Arcade, World Trade Centre, Cuffe Parade, Mumbai, 400005, India, 2000, 464 pages, ISBN 81-901068-1-3, \$80

These two volumes mark a magnificent starting point for the collector and student of Indian paper money. The two volumes represent several decades of research and collecting. The first volume is designed for the academic presentation of the subject, while the second volume is a handbook for collectors and dealers, based on the same research as the first volume. The first volume includes the full listing of Indian paper money presented in the second volume, but it is preceded by a 112 page historical introduction by the late Dr Gupta. This review will focus on the version published in the name of Dr Gupta and therefore covers the contents of the volume published in the name of Mr Jhunjunwalla. The coverage of the volume is the full history of paper money issued in India from the first issues made by the Calcutta-based Bank of Hindustan in 1770 down to the Reserve Bank of India notes being issued when the book went to press. The introduction and the catalogue are similarly structured into 14 sections. After a general introduction to the subject matter, the first section covers the notes of the private and semi-official banks of the period before 1861. The next four sections cover the issues of Imperial India: section 2 deals with the Government of India uniface notes, issued from 1861 until 1927, section 3 the portrait notes of George V, introduced from 1917, section 4 the continuation of such notes under George VI until Independence, and section 5 reaches outside of India to look at imperial issues used in Burma and in the Republic of Pakistan. The next section 6 covers the issues of the Republic of India since Independence, both Government and Reserve Bank issues. The next part of the book covers post-1871 non-national issues in five sections: section 7 deals with the notes of Hyderabad State issued 1917-1952, section 8 the rare Jammu and Kashmir notes of 1877, sections 9 and 10 the state notes and small-change coupons of western India, during the First and Second World War periods, and section 11 the currency notes issued for use in prisoner of war camps from 1901 until 1971. The next two sections cover the non-British colonial issues of India: section 12 on Portuguese and section 13 on French issues for their respective Indian territories. Section 14 discusses the evidence relating to non-surviving notes issued for the Indian National Army in 1944, and to later fantasy notes purporting to be the Indian National Army issues. The introduction is followed by two appendices: A on an abortive attempt at note issue by the State of Mysore in 1918 and B on the small change paper tokens issued on the Andaman Islands in 1860. The catalogue is completed by a section 15 listing private notes issued in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. In the introduction Gupta has assembled a narrative of the political, administrative and economic context of note issue, together with details of the designs

and security measures adopted. He also describes the formation and internal arrangements of the note issuing authorities, and the security printers involved in the production of notes for India. He outlines the circumstances in which Indian notes have circulated outside India - in Burma, Pakistan, the Gulf and in Saudi Arabia. He also provides the same range of information for local paper currency, both in the form of notes and coupons. In so doing he has brought to this new subject the same research and analytical skills he applied to his study of Indian coins.

The catalogue presents a detailed listing of all documented note issues, illustrating in full colour all the types of which examples are known. Each note is described, in terms of its design, its watermark, its colour, its known dates of issue, security number pre-fixes and authorisation signatures. The notes are arranged within the sections outlined above, according to the issuing authority, denomination, phase of issue, issue office, signature, security number prefix and date. The layout of the listing is made clear by the use of colour coding for the different sections, and by graphic representation of the scale of the illustrations. A numbering system specific to each denomination within each section makes the listing of each sub-group of notes very easy to follow. Each section is headed by a one page summary and a map showing the issue offices or local circulation zones. Where information can be easily presented in tables it has been done so, such as the lists of officers making the authorisation signatures, together with the dates of their office, or the lists of the denominations on which their signatures can be found.

In his introduction, Dr Gupta describes the moment of conception and gestation of this detailed study. While visiting the United States his imagination was fertilised by the probing questions of American collectors who quizzed him about the history of paper money in India. From this he came to realise the importance of paper money in the monetary history of modern India and started to collect information. With the aid of collectors, such as Mr M.M. Navati and Mr K. Jhunjhunwalla of Mumbai (Bombay) and Mr W. Barrett of Montreal and researchers such as Dr S. Bhandare, he was able to push the project through to its completion in 2000. His receptiveness to this initiative has borne fruit. The resulting volumes provide us with the first detailed and accurate account of paper money in India. The seeds have now been sown for paper money studies to stand alongside more traditional numismatics in India. On the basis of this comprehensive account, collectors will be able to fill the gaps, and scholars will be able to explore the minutiae of the subject.

I would only make one criticism. It would be very useful, particularly for the rare nineteenth century material, as well as for the local notes, to know where the specimens illustrated are held, so that future research can progress (a few sources are indicated for copyright purposes). Some of these early notes need first hand examination in order to reveal their secrets. Research into the role of security printers, the production of printing plates, the use of security numbers and signatures and the size of printing batches all have much to add to the study of nineteenth century paper money. The resources from this research are so scarce that it is always useful to know where the surviving specimens can be studied. This, however, is a very small criticism for what is a gigantic achievement, a true credit to the late Dr Gupta, who was without doubt the giant of twentieth century numismatic research in India. How fitting to end his career with a work of this stature to stand alongside his *Coins*, his *Ancient Indian*

Silver Punchmarked Coins and his *The Imperial Guptas*. Credit is also due to Mr Jhunjhunwalla and Dr Bhandare for the support they have given him in the achievement.

Joe Cribb

R. Krishnamurthy. Non-Roman Ancient Foreign Coins from Karur in India

pp. 145, including 10 colour plates and 6 maps; plus illustrations in the text. 8.5 by 6 ins., case-bound. Price Rs 600, \$30. Obtainable from Garnet Publishers, 34, 2nd Main Road, R.A.Puram, Chennai 600 028, Tamilnadu, India (Madras in now called Chennai. This book was noticed in ONS N/L 166)

Two of the major sites in the far south of India yielding a wide spectrum of early coins are the bed of the river Amaravati at Karur and the bed of the river Vaigai at Madurai. Karur and Madurai were both major commercial centres during the ancient period and both were also active in the field of Indo-Roman trade. Karur is now a small town in Central Tamilnadu, and it can be found on maps to the west of Trichy (Tiruchirapalli). A significant proportion of the Roman traders who reached Karur came by ship to the port of Muziris in modern Kerala (described by Pliny) and then went through the Palghat Pass and across the Kongu plain to Karur. The overland part of this route has been littered with coin hoards consisting mainly of early Imperial denarii and sometimes of aurei. Western copper coins do not feature in these hoards and are usually recovered from the river bed. From around the middle of the 4th century AD until the second half of the 5th century small, late Roman copper coins were themselves an important trade commodity, just as denarii had been during the earlier phase of Indo-Roman trade. These comments illustrate the background to Krishnamurthy's study.

Krishnamurthy has been studying the coins recovered from the river bed at Karur (and also at Madurai) for many years. His numerous papers have culminated in the publication of three books: *Late Roman copper coins from South India: Karur and Madurai* (1994), *Sangam Age Tamil coins* (1997) and the volume being reviewed here.

Non-Roman ancient foreign coins from Karur in India complements his two previous books and presents coins in his own collection which originated from outside the Indian subcontinent. The book is arranged into nine chapters, some of which are subdivided. Also included are a glossary, bibliography and index. The chapters are organised around the places where the coins found at Karur had originally been minted. These are spread around the eastern Mediterranean plus the mainland to the east. They are, in order, Thrace, Thessaly, Crete, Rhodes, the Seleucids, Phoenicia, Askalon, the Priest-Kings of Judaea, the Roman governors of Judaea, Parthia, Edessa and Aksum. The kingdom of Aksum in modern Ethiopia lay along the Red Sea maritime trade route to India. Each chapter consists of a brief introduction to the region and its coinage, followed by a description of the coin, or coins, with details of size and weight, and accompanied by both photos and line drawings. A total of forty one coins is catalogued. Most are of small size and in worn condition, as is also the case with late Roman bronzes of similar provenance. In the majority of cases sufficient detail is retained to identify the issuing city or state, but a few attributions can be debated.

This is an important study that opens up a new aspect to the investigation of ancient coin circulation and trade. Only a decade ago few scholars would have given serious consideration to any proposition that Hellenistic coins made their way to central Tamilnadu. Now this provenance is beyond doubt. I remember my own scepticism

when hearing, on a visit to Nasik, that someone claimed to be finding Ancient Greek coins at Karur. So I went to have a look. This proved to be the first of several enjoyable meetings with Mr Krishnamurthy and sessions examining and discussing his coins. A visit to Madurai brought to light an Aksumite copper coin among a motley selection of generally worn, late Roman, Chola and Vijayanagar coppers from the river Vaigai. A visit to the groups of people digging the river bed at Karur yielded a Hellenistic copper coin from Cos (*The coinage and history of Southern India; part 2*). I found ample corroboration for Mr Krishnamurthy's assertion that Ancient Greek coins really did reach the far south of India.

The interpretation of these coin finds provides the subject for the final chapter in the book: Observations. This is a subject that will no doubt continue to be debated for some time to come. Krishnamurthy favours the view that these coins reached southern India before the main phase of Indo-Roman trade, but discusses the alternative view that they travelled east during the Roman period (when many of the traders were Eastern Greeks, the Yavanas of Indian literature). These coin finds raise questions concerning trade between India and the West. They also raise questions concerning both the time span and the geography of circulation patterns for Hellenistic copper coinage. Krishnamurthy's book will be found relevant by those who are interested in Indian coinage, in Hellenistic coinage and also in ancient trade.

Michael Mitchiner

Dilip Rajgor. Punchmarked Coins of Early Historic India

Reesha Books International, California, 2001

221pp plus 16 black & white plates US\$70.00 hard covers

This book covers the silver punchmarked coinages of India from their origin c.600 BC to the time of the rise of Magadha c.400 BC. It fills the gap in the modern cataloguing of ancient Indian coins which was left after the volume of punchmarked coins of the Magadha-Mauryan period published in 1985 by Gupta and Hardaker.

The author claims this volume was the outcome of three years of tours collecting data in the field in 1992-1995, but it is in fact a much more complete and thorough work than this implies, as it also adds in all relevant coins that other authors have published over the years. It is thus set to become a standard work of reference for the series. Scholars, collectors and archaeologists will all welcome the filling of this gap. Our knowledge of the early punchmarked coinages of ancient India has grown from almost nothing in the 1930s, when pioneers like Durga Prasad published non-imperial types of coins for the first time. Since then the quest for objects from the past, whether from controlled excavation, metal detectors, or just chance finds, has vastly increased the number of types known. It is opportune now to harness all these finds and attempt to bring some order to them.

Dr. Rajgor has mastered his subject admirably, even though a lifelong study would not be sufficient to resolve all the problems that arise with the punchmarked series. The book comprises 22 pages of introductory text followed by a catalogue of all known types which are listed firstly under modern state headings, then within each modern state are listed the coins of what are assumed to be the ancient states. Symbols are drawn for all types in tabular form which greatly eases identification. The symbols have been specially drawn by Shailendra Bhandare whose work the reviewer can personally vouch for as of the highest possible standard of accuracy. Each type is given an estimated rarity, although in many cases this is actually a generalised expression of the rarity of the series as a whole. Each series is given an estimated date; in many cases this is a wide bracket as very little precise information on dating is available. Sixteen pages at the end show good quality photographs of selected coins. Some series are left without any photographic illustrations, presumably because no coins were available for photography. The author's archaeological background enables him to put early coinage in its economic setting, tracing the nature of trading prior to the introduction of coinage, as well as discussing the various terms found in Vedic literature that might pertain to weights and metals. The metrological table shows the theoretical weights of the three main weight systems that are recorded in the ancient literature, although as other workers have noted, the correspondence between these weights and the actual observed coin weights is poor. There is a very useful review of minting techniques, where distinction is made between flans produced by casting droplets and hammering out metal sheets. Coming to symbology, the author tabulates the symbols which seem to remain constant within the issues of individual janapadas and can therefore be claimed as the hallmarks of those states. However his table glosses over the complexity of the subject. For example the supposed symbol for Vanga actually fails to occur on seven of the eleven listed types, while six of these types actually bear the sun and six-armed symbol which are the hallmarks of

Magadha.

Such observations bring out a mild criticism - that all loose ends are rather too neatly tied up. Rajgor attributes all the coin types to janapadas - nothing is left in doubt. The reality may be more muddled, but at least the author provides the names of hoards for each Janapada that enable the attributions to be made. (The details of these hoards are not always available so a certain amount has to be taken on trust). The real problem that the boundaries of the ancient states are not known to us with any precision and they would in any case have varied in time as political power waxed and waned amongst rival factions. The act of making an attribution in print does not, unfortunately, confirm it as fact, but on past experience we can be sure all these attributions will be quoted as fact in dealers' lists, and, perhaps more seriously, used by scholars and archaeologists in support of their studies.

As an example of one of the unsolved problems we can cite the confusion in separating coins of Kashi and Kosala states. Rajgor defines three state symbols for Kashi and three others for Kosala (fig.1). He mentions the similarity of symbols on the later issues of Kashi with those of Kosala Janapada. However he does not point out that the so-called state symbols of Kashi can be seen on coins that also bear the state symbols of Kosala, e.g. on coins 771-789, 886-888, 891-892, and that such coins do not seem to come at the tail end of the series, but somewhere in the middle. To present the two series as clearly separated is surely dodging the issue.

However in a catalogue of this kind there does have to be a limit to the amount of discussion that can be devoted to the polemics of the subject. The primary aim is to get the coins published and perhaps hope that this in itself will stimulate discussion. Thus on the date of the introduction of coinage to India, Rajgor discusses briefly the different dates that have been proposed and then opts for the middle path as argued by Gupta and Hardaker (1985). Likewise the date of Buddha's nirvana is accepted at 486 BC without comment.

This Catalogue is supposed to terminate at c.400 BC on the rise of the Magadha empire. One rather serious criticism of the work is that the author has included a number of non-Imperial coin series which clearly belong to a later period. After the decline of Mauryan power in India independent states rose again which, for a short period, coined in a style somewhat reminiscent of the pre-Mauryan coinages. Such coins can usually be set apart if they are diestruck and their symbology borrows from the Mauryan repertoire. As opposed to coins struck with a single punchmark (discernible from its size being smaller than the flan), coins struck from dies did not begin in India until the Indo-Greek period, which comes at the end of the Mauryan age, and well after the pre-Mauryan coinages. Thus coins which show large dies whose edges fall beyond the flan, and which show double-sided die striking, will certainly not be pre-Mauryan. Such are the coins attributed by Rajgor to Haryana from the Babyal hoard, which he dates, without any explanation, to c.450-300 BC. Some of these coins also show a variant of the Mauryan six-armed symbol on the reverse thus confirming their late date.

Other series whose early dating the reviewer would question are (a) the Surashtra

series (Series 18 in the Catalogue), which are single die coins including complex, delicate symbols such as two elephants sprinkling Lakshmi, and tree-in-railing with bull symbols borrowed from the Mauryan period, (b) the Kuru coins (Series 68) which are single die with Mauryan-inspired symbols such as elephant with rider, (c) Panchala coins (Series 73) likewise single die using Mauryan symbols, (d) Shurasena coins (Series 76) which are the "fish-lion" coins employing single dies with tiny Mauryan adjunct symbols such as taurines and trisceles not seen in the early period.

Collectors should be wary of the proliferation of small variants classed as separate types in the catalogue. It is often difficult to know when a variation on a symbol is intentional or simply the result of lack of precision in the minds of the engravers. Presence or absence of pellets on symbols is often difficult to interpret, as for example the central pellet on the bent bar coins of Gandhara, or on the Kosala state symbol. Likewise some of the variations in the Narhan coins or the fish-lion series, may just be poorly controlled workmanship.

The book has a few other curiosities. The coins of Series 80 from Ayodhya seem to be identical in weight, fabric and symbology to those of Series 33 (the so-called Narhan coins). The "Identification Guide" in the Introduction, illustrating one coin from each series, is a useful concept except that only 30 of the 82 series are covered and they are in random order.

A separate price guide comes with the book. This is perhaps a good idea, as the prices may become out-of-date and the loose guide might be replaced with a revised one without having to purchase a new book. Prices are estimated in US dollars in fine and very fine, except for very rare coins which are not valued. However, as has been shown from other attempts to place values on coins in standard catalogues, (e.g. in works by Mitchiner) the marketplace sets its own prices almost regardless of the hypothetical values in this kind of catalogue.

Any work as ambitious as this is bound to have its faults. That cannot detract from the thorough research and careful attention to detail which will ensure the usefulness of Dr. Rajgor's efforts for many years to come. The book will certainly be a must for all numismatists interested in early India but it also deserves to reach a wider market for archaeologists and historians.

Terry Hardaker, Oxford

Sylloge Numorum Arabicorum Tübingen.

Hamah. IVc Bilad as-Sam III

by **Lorenz Korn**. Tübingen, Ernst Wasmuth, 1998, 58 pp., including 21 plates. ISBN 3 8030 1102 7.

ISSN 0945-4020

The present volume illustrates and describes 708 coins from the mint of Hamah in the University of Tübingen collection, struck between the 570s and the 830s of the Hijra (roughly AD 1175-1430), by far the largest group of coins from that mint ever assembled, much less published. The book is in folio format, comprising a short foreward by the general editor, Lutz Ilisch, a five-page introduction packed with historical and numismatic information, 21 superb plates matches with 21 pages of coin descriptions, and finally a concordance of catalogue and inventory numbers, where provenances are given when known.

Coins are arranged in chronological order, with the one exception that for each ruler, silver coins are listed first, then copper. This was necessary because the coppers are usually undated, the silvers dated, so that the relative dating of the copper to the silver cannot be determined. Silver coins without dates and with uncertain or unread dates are inserted into the chronological list where the author felt they would best fit, so as to maintain as accurate a sequence as possible. Uncertain and undated pieces are clearly described as such in the catalogue.

The collection includes virtually every type of silver and copper coin known from Hamah; only the gold, of which fewer than half a dozen specimens are recorded, is omitted. Because of the overall completeness of the collection, reference is made to types not represented, either in the introduction or in the catalogue. This was not feasible for other volumes of the Sylloge so far published.

There is also a very full bibliography of just 20 items, a detail that says everything about the amount of research done on the subject over the past 200 years.

Descriptions in the catalogue are kept brief, as befits a sylloge publication. Inscriptions are written out in Arabic, without transcriptions or transliterations. The layout and format of the catalogue is generally quite clear, though I have three small criticisms. It would be useful to repeat rulers' dates each time the ruler is given, not just for the first mention of that ruler; this is a simple change that would not add lines to the text. Secondly, the coin dates are given in italics, but bold italics would make it easier for the reader to scan the page when looking for specific dates. Finally, the method of noting die-linkage is very cumbersome. For example, it takes quite some time to determine that for coins 132-139, the die links are for the obverse: 132=133=134=135 (if the comment to the reverse die of 135 were correct) and for the reverse 132=133=134, 136=137(=129=130=131) and 138=139. If indicated in this notation as a short comment after coin 139, the comment would have been clearer and space would have been saved. There are four typos in the text to nos. 132-139, all of which refer to die-linkage. For coin 132, the descriptions says the obverse is die-identical with coin 132, an obvious tautology, though with careful reading, it becomes clear that 132 is a typo for 133. Secondly, it is not clear from the text whether the obverse die for 132 and 133 is really the same as that for 134 and 135. Fortunately the plates are so good that one can readily see that the two dies are distinct, and that the comment to 135, "Av. stempelgleich mit den drei vorhergehenden" is an error for "Av. stempelgleich mit der vorhergehenden". Thirdly, for 136 and 137, the correct reverse die identity is with 132-134, not 129-131. Moreover, in the description to 138 and 139, the obverse marginal inscription is as nos. 132-135, not 129-132. These typos would

likely have been averted had the die-linkage been presented as follows:
Stempelgleichungen: Av.: 132=133, 134=135. Rev.: 132=133=134=136=137,
138=139.

Despite what I have found for coins 132-139, typos seem to be few and far between. However, I have not checked other die identities, nor have I examined the photos to determine whether the listed die-linkages are indeed correct.

My only other criticism is one which applies to all the volumes of the Tübingen sylloge thus far published, and that is the cumbersome folio size. In my opinion, A4 is the best size for a sylloge, insofar as it constitutes a good compromise between, on the one hand, maximising the number of coins on a plate, and on the other hand, ease of use and storage. Moreover, packing and shipping thin, folio size books is tedious, and there have been a significant number of copies destroyed or damaged in shipment. It is no surprise that, after about more than 50 years of folio size publications, the Sylloge Numorum Graecorum went over to A4 in the early 1980s.

Despite these few flaws, Korn's work is truly a masterpiece of numismatic cataloguing. There is no doubt that for anyone interested in the coinage of Hamah or in the coinage of the Ayyubid and Mamluk kingdoms, this volume will remain indispensable for many, many decades. Of course, there will be new discoveries, perhaps some of them even spectacular, but the basis established by Korn will forever remain one of the greatest steps forward in Ayyubid and Mamluk numismatics.

Because the volume under review contains the coins of just a single mint, the question of whether coins should be arranged dynastically or geographically is moot. Perhaps for that very reason, the present review is an appropriate place to discuss this question, for it remains one of most controversial aspects of the sylloge format, which was first developed for ancient Greek numismatics, the first volume appearing in 1931. Because coin-issuing entities in the archaic and classical Greek period were city-states, a geographical arrangement was natural and perfectly suitable, though for the Hellenistic period, the dynastic arrangement was often adopted (British Museum catalogues). Thus the arrangement of coins in most Greek sylloges has been a hybrid of geographical and dynastic principles, though in recent years, the purely geographical arrangement has emerged paramount.

The big question is whether the geographical arrangement can successfully be carried over to Islamic coinage, where a dynastic arrangement, as originally established by Fraehn, Sachau and others in the early 19th century, has become the norm for museum catalogues, general studies, auction catalogues and sale lists. The answer depends to a large extent on the intended audience of the publication. Specifically, collectors and dealers are generally more comfortable with the dynastic approach, in the British Museum catalogues of the 1880s or my 1998 Checklist of Islamic Coins. On the other hand, historians are much more interested in the continuity of coinage at a particular location. Thus, in my recent study of the anonymous Barakzay coinage in 19th century Afghanistan, published in 1999 as a supplement to this journal, I chose to organize the study by mint, in order to show political and monetary developments in each of the major subdivisions of the Barakzay lands. It is also the principle that has made George Miles' 1938 study, *The Numismatic History of Rayy*, so valuable for the political history of early Islamic Iran.

There can be problems with the geographic arrangement, as is apparent to anyone who has ever tried to make use of the ANS publication of the Arthur Houghton collection of Seleukid coins. The coins are arranged by mint, moving roughly from west to east. But the mints are noted only by symbols or isolated letters,

whose meaning would be known only to those perhaps already well-versed in the coinage. To a collector or dealer trying to identify a coin, this is inconvenient, especially as there is no index of issuers or symbols. For the volumes of the Sylloge of Islamic Coins in the Ashmolean, the general editor has insisted that a proper index of all names and titles be included with each volume, a feature with which I am in complete agreement. There is no index in any of the Tübingen sylloge volumes thus far published, and I would hope that one will be included in all future volumes, even those, such as the present volume, that are devoted to a single mint.

The main purpose of any sylloge is to make available for research the entire holdings of a public or private collection in book format, with each coin briefly described and carefully photographed. Their principal function is to facilitate research by averting the need for long and costly visits to collections scattered throughout the world. An important secondary function is to provide access to quality illustrations, thus reducing greatly the burden on museum curators who would otherwise be spending a lot more time supervising visitors. For the researcher, the convenience of the sylloge format goes far beyond convenience, for it allows him to ask questions and begin research before investing time and money in visits to museums and other collections, perhaps not so much a problem for someone living an hour's journey from London, but what about someone working in Arizona or Adelaide? The large number of sylloge volumes in Greek coinage (I believe over 250 volumes have so far been published) has meant that one can ask a question, examine the sylloges (and for more expensive coin types, auction catalogues as well), and come to some sense of whether the question or research is feasible or whether it leads down a blind alley.

Although collectors and dealers probably represent a majority of buyers of sylloge volumes, the books are only tangentially intended for their use. Of course, collectors and dealers should be encouraged to use them, and their purchases certainly help reduce the amount of grants and other subsidies needed for their publication. Sylloge volumes are a very specialised and rather expensive endeavour; no volume will ever run the risk of making The New York Times's bestseller list.

To some extent, the arrangement of a sylloge volume may depend on the relative completeness of the collection being catalogued. For most of the Islamic world, Tübingen probably has the densest representation of silver and copper coins of any major collection, especially for Iran. For such collections of relative completeness, the story of the mint's history is closely reflected in the coins held at Tübingen. That is clearly apparent for Hamah, just as for most of the Palestinian mints, places like Ghazna or Kabul, etc. For smaller collections, such as that of the Fitzwilliam Museum at Cambridge (somewhat over 3000 coins), the mint arrangement would seem less appropriate. Indeed, Mark Blackburn and Patrick Novak have chosen a dynastic arrangement for the Fitzwilliam sylloge, following more or less the order of my Checklist of Islamic Coins. I understand that a full index of mints will be provided for the Fitzwilliam volume(s).

Personally, I find it much simpler to come to an understanding of the general nature of a dynasty's coinage than to determine how the coins of a single mint or region fit together during times of political instability or dynastic change. Thus, by observing the sequence at a given mint, the history of the location is illuminated in a way that I would find much more difficult to reconstruct were I forced to look separately at each dynasty or ruler.

If we agree that sylloges of large collections should be organised geographically, what about medium and small collections? If they are specialised collections of specific regions or dynasties, then definitely so. However, smaller

general collections, such as that of the Fitzwilliam, are probably more amenable to a dynastic listing, so long as a good mint index is appended. For middle size collections, say those which would fit into roughly four to a dozen volumes, I would prefer the geographical arrangement.

Of course, there is no dictum from on high telling each author or editor how to organise a sylloge volume. Different authors and editors will surely take different approaches. Not all will prefer the arrangement by mint, not even within the publication of a single collection. Some volumes of the Ashmolean Museum sylloge will be arranged dynastically, because the authors of those volumes find it more appropriate or more convenient.

Steve Album

**SYLLOGE OF ISLAMIC COINS IN THE ASHMOLEAN
Volume 10, ARABIA AND EAST AFRICA**

by **Stephen Album**. Ashmolean Museum Oxford, 1999 (published 2000).

Hard bound, 92 pages including 34 plates; ISBN 1 85444 125 6;

Price GBP 35, USD 60.

E-mail: album@sonic.net

The book under a review is the first of a planned series of ten volumes cataloguing the Islamic coins now in possession of the Ashmolean Museum in Oxford. There was a good reason for the last volume being published first and that is explained by the series editor, Luke Treadwell, in a foreword. The coins catalogued are not only those which are permanent holdings of the Heberden Coin Room, but also those in the Samir Shamma collection deposited in the Museum on long-term loan. Next come an introduction to the coinages of Arabian peninsula and East Africa from the beginning of Islam up to the introduction of machine-struck coins. The numismatic history of Yemen is given first. In an overview - after the quotation of some standard works on this subject known to the author - are listed the dates of striking of particular denominations, a discussion of the metrology, terminology, monetary systems and general history. As a reviewer I would like to make the following remarks and additions to the author's statements:

1. The first known published fals with mint-name San`a was struck in 139 AH (August, 1962); the silver coin of year 172 AH has, on the State Hermitage, SPb. piece (GE No. 1272) the name written as al-Ghitrif (not fully visible on the Ashmolean specimen) and the first gold dinar ascribable to Yemen (though without mint-name) is of 201 AH (Turath collection, Part I, Spink 133, # 37), that with mint-name San`a of 215 AH (Artuks, Part I, # 299, p.86, tab.V).

2. The first series of dinars is known with the dates 201 (and names Muhammad and `Abdallah), 202, 203, 204 (all with name Muhammad only) and the last is 205 (with name al-Ifriqi). The identity of Muhammad was a matter of some confusion. Those coins were published for the first time by Kubitschek and Muller in 1899 without specific attribution. Later some numismatists (Darley-Doran 1988, Nebehay 1989) ascribed the coins with the name Muhammad to Muhammad b. Ziyad and recently a cataloguer of the Turath collection ascribed coins of 201 and 204 AH to Muhammad b. `Ali b. `Isa b. Mahan, with `Abdallah being his son and deputy at San`a in 201. In other sources the ism of this governor is given as Hamdavayh (Bikhazi, 1970); Muhammad b. Mahan is mentioned also by G. R. Smith in his list of San`ani governors in 1983. In SICA there is listed a silver coin, probably of 204 AH, with the names Muhammad and al-Ifriqi (# 221). The author connected the ism and nisba of these two persons to one, Muhammad al-Ifriqi. The ism of al-Ifriqi is given as Ibrahim (by both Bikhazi and Smith), so the mentioned coin was struck under joint authority.

3. The name of the post-249 dinar is known as al-mutawwaq and its weight standard (norm) was 2/3 mithqal and 2 habbah (i.e. 2,9573 g); the post-303 gold coins were known as dinar as`adi with weight of 2/3 qaflah (i.e. 1,9833 g). There is no specific reason to describe post-313 dinars of distinctive type and calligraphy as dinar amiri, as almost all dinars struck without the name of a local ruler or `Abbasid governor were issued under the authority of a Yu`firid amir after the 30s of the 3rd century AH (but they do have the appearance of `Abbasid issues). Though there are no known coins with the names of the Yu`firids, rulers of the Ziyadid(?) and Tarfid(?) dynasties placed their own names on the coins in 346 AH and 350 AH respectively.

The weight standard of their dinar was originally 2/3 mithqal (i.e. 2,8333 g) and was called `aththariyyah probably after the most widespread coins of the time (used also in al-Makkah).

4. There is also a short discussion of Ottoman coinage in Yemen, though not a single coin is represented in either collections. Ottoman authority, at least nominally, was acknowledged in some parts of Yemen already in 922 AH since coins of that date are known from Zabid (Nadir Osmanl? Madeni Paralar?, Istanbul 1973, # 4 etc.) and probably from al-Hudaydah, too. Gold coins of Murad III (dhahab al-sultani or altun or alt?n) have been published from the mint of San`a (C. Olcer, TND Bulten No. 26, p. 18) and Muhammad (Mehmed) III. (Artuks, Part II, Istanbul 1974, # 1655, p. 566).

5. The weight of waqiyyah/uqiyyah in Yemen certainly fluctuated at times according to area and purposes of usage in a similar way as they did in other parts of the Islamic world. There are known one waqiyyah weight of 33,2677g and two waqiyyah stamped by (imam Ahmad) an-Nasirlidin Allah and date (1)375 of 66,0284g.

After the Yemeni chapter there is information on the so-called Asir hoard, al-Yamama and al-Hijaz coins and a study on East Africa Islamic numismatics (Shanga, Pemba, Kilwa, Zanzibar, Mogadishu, Mombasa, Lamu and Harar).

The introductory essay is followed by a bibliography and indices of names, titles and dynasties which highly facilitate the usage of the catalogue.

The catalogue itself is in sylloge format with short description of 728 coins illustrated on 34 plates. The coins are grouped into 2 sections - Arabia and East Africa. Arabian coins are listed chronologically within each mint, arranged according to the Arabic alphabet (but the mint-name is strangely given in English transcription only). East African coins are listed regionally in English alphabetical order. It is obvious that such an arrangement, though practical, has should also have been divided regionally into Yemen and `Asir, `Uman and the rest of the peninsula (al-Hijaz and al-Yamama).

In the catalogue part are many remarkable, unique or previously unpublished pieces. It is noted, however, that many common coins are missing from both collection, so "not published in SICA" would not mean a rare coin.

Some published coins are well below the average state of preservation available on the market (e.g. Rasulid dirhams etc.). The coins from the `Asir hoard were partially reattributed through comparison with previous listings and die-link studies for which the authour is to be congratulated.

I have only a few remarks on the catalogue part:

289: the coin has the same rev. as # 290 (in private collection).

308: was published by Lachman in NI Bulletin, p. 156, fig. 1-2 and tentatively attributed to Ahmad b. Hashim, 1266-1267 AH, which, of course, does not mean that the attribution in SICA cannot be a correct one.

309: this is not the type published by Lachman in 1990, p.7, # 17 - on that coin (from private coll.) is clearly the legend al-imam al-Hadi on obv.; on coin # 309 there is only al-Hadi. This is a different type (and maybe a denomination, too) with at least 2 sub-types/variants - either with 4 dots or a circle in the centre of the side with the mint-name, most probably struck during different reigns or periods. The calligraphy of the coin with the circle is a bit better, so this could have been struck in 1256-1259 AH and those with 4 dots in 1265-1266 or 1267-1269 or even 1272-1276 AH by `Ali b. `Abdallah or Ghalib b. Muhammad respectively.

552: the last word on the obverse is probably bi-San`a, so the coin could be attributed to this mint-place.

The whole work, as published, is masterly written by an esteemed specialist in Islamic numismatics and the book is highly recommended to anybody interested in this subject. It certainly give an impetus to further studies of those series, which are still not fully understood. More research of other public and private collections is needed as is the cooperation of enthusiasts in this field. Finally, I would like to express my wish and hope that by the time this review is published, the author will be fully recovered from his recent injury and will continue his work on publishing further volumes of SICA as planned.

Dr.Vladimir Suchy

SICA - BIBLIOGRAPHY

Artuk, I. + Artuk, C.: Istanbul Arkeoloji Muzeleri Teshirdeki Islami Sikkeler Katalogu. Cilt I. Istanbul 1970.

Augst, B.: Inedita razeb umajjovskych a abbasovskych ze sbirky autorovy. (Tab. II). In: Numismaticky sbornik 7, Praha 1962; pp. 61-67 (Russian and French resumes, pp. 68-69; Quelques frappes inedites des Omeyyades et des `Abbassides de ma collection de monnaies).

Bikhazi, R.J.: Coins of al-Yaman 132-569 A.H. In: al-Abhath, vol. XXIII; Nos. 1-4; December, 1970.

Darley-Doran, R.E.: Examples of Islamic Coinage from Yemen. In: Yemen - 3000 Years of Art and Civilisation in Arabia Felix, ed. W. Daum; pp. 182-203. Innsbruck - Frankfurt/Main (published in conjunction with the exhibition at Munchen 1987-1988).

Kubitschek, J.W. + Muller, D.H.: Munzen. In: Sudarabische Alterthumer im Kunsthistorischen Hofmuseum, ed. D.H. Muller; pp. 65-79. Wien 1899.

Lachman, S.: The Coins of the Zaidi Imams of the Period 1224-1265 H/ 1809-1849. In: Spink Numismatic Circular, vol. 98; No. 1 (February 1990); pp. 1-7.

Lachman S.: The Coins of the Zaidi Imams of the Yemen in the 3rd Quarter of the 19th Century. In: Numismatics International Bulletin, vol. 25; No. 7 (July 1990); pp. 149-160.

Nebehay, S.: Muslimische Munzen aus dem Jemen. In: Jemen - Land der Konigin von Saba, ed. A. Janata, pp. 112-145 (Kat. Nr. N 32 - N 51, pp. 145-151). Wien (published for the exhibition 1989-1990).

Smith, G. Rex: List of Governors of the Yemen Resident in San`a`, pp. 53-54 of Chapter 7, The Early and Medieval History of San`a`, ca. 622-953/1515. In: San`a` an Arabian Islamic City, ed. R.B. Serjeant + R. Lewcock; pp. 49-67. London 1983.

Turath Collection Part I. In: Spink in Association with Christie`s Auction 133; Islamic Coins, London 25 May 1999.

Dr.Vladimir Suchy

THE MEXICAN PIECES OF EIGHT REALES and their domination in South East Asia;

an historic survey of more than three centuries of a trading coin

by **J. Busschers**, Driebergen (Netherlands) 1999, 155 pages, A4.

Spiral bound (ISBN 90-805431-1-X) price NLG 38.= + H&P; hard bound (ISBN 90-805431-2-8) NLG 75.= + H&P.

The Spanish-American eight real represents, no-doubt, the most widely used international trade coin. The denomination of the real finds its origin in Europe, but with the discovery by the middle of the 16th century of the rich silver deposits in Mexico and somewhat later in Potosi, in present Bolivia, the international flow of precious metals changed entirely.

At the same time, considerable silver deposits were also found in Central Europe, which led to the introduction of the taler, a silver coin of almost equal value to the Spanish eight real piece.

The hegemony of the gold currency for payment of large trade transactions of capital goods was soon overtaken by silver currency of equivalent value to the former gold currency. By the end of the 16th century large silver coins of approximately 27 to 30 grams largely took over the role of gold. The present publication provides an most interesting survey of the history of the eight real pieces, their minting in Spanish America and the coin's dominant role in South East Asian trade. Economic and nautical aspects are discussed as well as events in Europe that influenced those developments. An attempt has also been made to obtain an impression of the volume of reales despatched to South East Asia. The survey has been compiled using presently available printed information from all kinds of sources. As a rule, these sources of information are often restricted to a particular area, period or subject. Moreover the information derived from the various sources is sometimes also conflicting. The author of the present publication has tried to define how the various elements inter-relate, and to compile an overview of the global history of the most important trade coin, which in due course became known as the Spanish dollar.

Particularly for trade purposes, this denomination was also adopted by many other nations, including the United States of America, and as such its legacy continues.

The book covers the period from the 16th to the 20th century and starts with an overview of the relevant data for Europe, America and Asia. The textual part of it is divided by chapters for each successive centuries, viz. 16th, 17th, 18th, 19th and 20th century. An appendix and bibliography completes the textual part. The publication is illustrated throughout with excellent photographs and various diagrams and a number of tables. A supplement of 42 fine plates of photographs of about 90 coins completes the book. The photographs have been arranged in chronological order, and are accompanied by brief descriptive texts. In order to facilitate detailed reproduction, and to show the beauty of the coins, they have been enlarged 1.75 times the actual size.

It is, as far I know, the first time that an integral publication has appeared of the world's most important trade coin. The prime importance of this trade coin in Asia and the many Asian derivations of this denomination will make this publication of interest to many.

Jan Lingen

RUHUNA, An Ancient Civilisation Re-Visited.

Numismatic and Archaeological evidence in Inland and Maritime Trade

by Osmund Bopearachchi & Rajah M. Wickremesinhe. Colombo, 1999. 145 p.; 43 plates; 30 cm. ISBN 955-96816-0-5.

Price: US\$ 75,=. Postage & packing to Europe (air mail) US\$ 6,= and North America US\$ 8,=.

Available from: **Lake House Book Shop**, 100 Sri Chittampalam A. Gardener Mawatha, Colombo 2, Sri Lanka. E-mail: bookshop@sri.lanka.net

The present book is in the tradition of two earlier publications of **Osmund Bopearachchi** as co-author, viz.: *Pre-Kushana Coins in Pakistan* with Aman ur Rahman (1995) and *Ancient Indian Coins* with Wilfried Pieper (1998). The present publication is based on coins, seals, sealings, moulds, intaglios and other antiquities from the collection of Rajah M. Wickremesinhe. The importance of the publication lies in the fact that all the published artefacts come from the area of **Tissamaharama** of ancient **Ruhuna** on the south-eastern part of the island. This, together with the results from the scientific, archaeological excavations carried out by the *French Mission of Archaeological Co-operation* in Sri Lanka makes this publication of foremost importance. Nowadays the main reason for visitors to come to Tissamaharama is the *Yala West National Park*, but the antiquity of the place goes back to the 3rd century BC.

The fact that the artefacts from this area were collected systematically and over a long period makes this collection very important, particular the coins of a lead alloy, with an early Brahmi inscription, and which are brought to light in this publication for the first time. On the basis of the palaeography, these early inscribed coins may be attributed to the 2nd century BC. No such inscribed coins were known or published from the island, nor from the Indian sub-continent. These coins bear legends of personal names in the Sinhala-Prakrit language written in early Brahmi. On a visit to the Island during the winter-season of 1994/95, I obtained a similar coin in Colombo. It took me some years to get the inscription translated and with the help of Chandrika N. Jayasinghe (*Dep. of Archaeology*, Colombo), Osmund Bopearachchi, F.R. Allchin (Emeritus Reader in *Indian Studies University of Cambridge*) and particular Prof. Harry Falk (*Institut für Indische Philologie und Kunstgeschichte, Berlin*), I finally succeeded in getting the inscription deciphered. As it is a variety not published in the present publication I have illustrated it below.



Legend: Gahapati-Utara-puta-Tisha

Translation: of Tissa son of Gahapati (householder) Utara.

Weight: 3,65 gm.

During the same winter-season of 1994/95 I also went to India to attend the 4th *International Colloquium* at the *Indian Institute for Research in Numismatic Studies* at *Nashik*. On my way to Nashik I visited Goa and from a dealer in Mapusa I obtained

an old inscribed coin which now has also turned out to be from Huruna. The coin is cast from the same mould as the coin published and illustrated by the authors as E 12. Moreover it is, as far as I know, the first of its kind found in a non-Ceylonese context. As the present coin is slightly better preserved than the one published I take the opportunity to illustrate the piece here too. Again Prof. Harry Falk was kind enough to get the inscription read for this piece too.



Legend: Gaha*pa*ti-Guta-puta-Gutaha, with Shanka (?) and trisul in the centre.

Translation: of Gutta (skt. Gupta), son of the Gahapati (householder) Gutta.

Weight: 5,27 gm.

Besides the "A - inscribed coins", the following subjects are covered in the book:

B-Inscribed coin mould

C-Inscribed seals

D-Inscribed sealings

E-Uncertain inscribed coins

F-Uninscribed coins

G-Coins of foreign origin

H-Local coins

I-Money boxes and coin hoards

J-Seals

K-Sealings

L-Moulds

M-Lead objects

N-Miscellaneous objects

O-Intaglios

P-Beads

A seven-page conclusion finalises the text, followed by a catalogue of hundreds of objects, most of which have never been published before. As the photographs are sometimes missing sufficient detail, most of the objects are catalogued by excellent eye-copy drawings prepared by Wielfried Pieper. The book is completed by a table of Brahmi Script in Ceylon used from 3rd century BC to 1st century AD, an extensive bibliography, as well as a few maps.

It hardly needs me to say that the book is an important publication written by the foremost authority in this field, Prof. Osmund Bopearachchi, director French Mission of Archaeological Co-operation in Sri Lanka, Professor habilité, University of Paris IV-Sorbonne and Senior Researcher of the French National Centre for Scientific Research. The book provides the state of the art of what is presently known on the early coinage of Sri Lanka as well as on other subjects, which is largely missing in the well-known book of W.H. Codrington, *Ceylon Coins and Currency* (Colombo, 1924). Since the publication of Codrington's book an extensive amount of archaeological and numismatic research has been undertaken much of which has not so far been properly and scientifically published. This publication fills, to some extent, this gap

and ought, in my opinion, to be on the shelves of everyone who, either professionally or privately, is interested in the archaeological and numismatic history of the South-Asia.

Jan Lingen

**Necdet Kabaklarli: "Mangir" Osmanli Imparatorlugu Bakir Paralari
Copper Coins of Ottoman Empire 1299-1808**

Usaklilar Egitim ye Kultur Vakfi, Istanbul 1998.

ISBN-975-96468-0-3.

XII, 564 pages with 3 tables and 6 graphs, 67 full page photo tables, 3 maps in colour.
Hardbound \$ 250

The author N. Kabaklarli was born at Usak, Turkey, in 1938. He graduated from the Economics Department at the Middle East Technical University in 1962. After graduating he studied woolen yarn and fabric manufacture at the Department of Textile Industry at the University of Leeds, England, until 1963. Then he was a manufacturer of textile products in Turkey. He is president of the Usaklilar Educational and Cultural Foundation. Kabaklarli has collected Ottoman copper coins for 40 years and during this time he has probably accumulated the most important collection of this kind.

The present book, written in Turkish and in English, was completed in 1997. The book describes not only the coins in the author's collection, but also those found in numerous museums at home and abroad and those in many private collections, altogether about 3000 coins. It seems that only the literature up to 1984 has been taken into consideration. The catalogue contains all copper coins from the very beginning of the Ottoman Empire until the end of the reign of sultan Selim III (1808), but only those coins were taken into consideration that could unequivocally be attributed to a certain sultan. Purely ornamental coins which neither show the minting place nor the year of minting were not included in the book (there is a special book on this subject, written by Olcer in 1975).

After the introduction in Turkish a presentation in English follows which is really worth reading (21 pages). All essential aspects of minting of mangirs are discussed here. He points out in detail how the minting of copper coins essentially bore no other function for the Sublime Porte than that of acquiring additional income in periodical intervals. The copper coins were demonetised once a year and people were forced to buy new mangirs, to be paid in silver (akche). Kabaklarli was the first to realise that there also existed special "tax mangirs", inscribed with legends "tish ayyad" or "barraanii" (these words were formerly misread as minting places). Equally new are weight distribution diagrams, drawn for the first time for the coins of altogether 6 sultans. Hitherto it had not been possible to establish such statistics since there were not enough coins at hand.

In the main part of the book, about 1200 coins are shown and described on 507 pages. For the many varieties only weights and diameters are mentioned. All drawings are enlarged, actually on unknown and differing scales. The major part of the drawings is excellent, but also less talented drawers have been at work. A certain proportion of the drawings shows the coins as they are, incompletely struck and not fully legible. Roughly a third shows complete drawings of the legends and designs. Next to the drawings the Arabic inscriptions are given in transliteration, completed, if necessary. The catalogue contains an abundance of coins so far unknown and many from very rare mints: Adilcevaz, Basra, Bergama, Cemiskezek, and Siirt, to give only a few examples. Of equal importance are the references to mint errors and overstrikes which may drive all those to despair who are less familiar with the Arabic language. The relatively large number of countermarked coins is also new and surprising. The many references to "copper coins minted with dies intended for silver coins" are also worth considering. Surely these coins are without exception temporary forgeries. In

many cases the corresponding photos show that for this kind of coinage forged dies had been used.

At the end of the book there are 67 full page photo tables of good quality. The photos show the coins enlarged on an unknown scale. Unfortunately, there are many printing errors in the text and in the tables (it starts with the missing "the" in the English title) but the well-informed reader will certainly understand it.

This publication is the most comprehensive description of Ottoman copper coins ever written, and thus an important contribution to the studies on Ottoman numismatics, and much honoured by all experts in this field. All those who are interested in the difficult field of Ottoman copper coins will derive great benefit from this book. The author has donated his entire collection of copper coins to the Usak Archeological Museum, and the revenue from the sale of his book he has donated to the Us*klilar Educational and Cultural Foundation. This may be a consolation for all those who feel that the price of the book is too high.

Wilski

Catalogue of the Aksumite Coins in the British Museum

By Stuart Munro-Hay.

Published by British Museum Press, 1999. 47 pages and 69 plates. ¥65.

Until ten years ago, the British Museum collection of Aksumite coins was modest, containing only 100 coins. In 1989 the museum purchased the collection of 552 coins built up by Roger Brereton while he was living in Ethiopia. This presented the opportunity for a catalogue and it is a pleasure to welcome this volume to set beside publications of other collections, like that of Munro-Hay's own in 1986. Initially expected in 1995, its publication has been delayed, apparently by difficulties with the plates, and the bibliography includes no entries after 1995.

After a general introduction (with map), bibliography and outline chronology comes the catalogue proper followed by the plates. It would have been useful to include a table of the Ge'ez alphabet. Using the same type numbers as the standard work Aksumite Coinage by Munro-Hay and Juel-Jensen (henceforth AC), the catalogue provides concise descriptions of each type whether present in the museum collection or not. Each BM coin is given a unique number and its accession number, weight and die axis are provided with notes on varieties, especially the symbols on the later coins (though these are not all noted and it is worth checking the plates and AC for further varieties). It is a pity that provenance and previous publications are not included; nor is there a history of the collection. So for BM 20, the unique large copper of Aphilas, the heaviest Aksumite coin known, while the accession number tells us it arrived at the BM in 1873 we must turn to Aksumite Coinage to discover that it was first published by Prideaux in 1884. The Brereton coins are identifiable from their 1989 accession numbers. 24 forgeries (all but one ex Brereton) are also described.

All coins are well illustrated on the plates at x2 magnification. This is the most important section of the book. There are long runs of the copper coins (including 162 of the first anonymous type, 83 of the second and 58 of Armah) and while this occasionally includes a very worn specimen, it does make available to students illustrations of many different dies. Some of the types not represented in the BM are illustrated from specimens in the Juel--Jensen collection; the unique gold of Wazeba in the BibliothÉque Nationale, Paris, is also illustrated (curiously at x1). There are only a few slips in the text. On p.14 the tiny gold piece of Aphilas is described as a one-sixteenth piece rather than a one-eighth. In the catalogue: type 11 obverse should be as type 10 not type 9; type 63 variety should not have an additional CA at the end of the obverse legend; for type 88 the reverse legends of BM 403 and 404 are not clearly described; types 122 and 123 are reversed re AC; for type 144 the second Ge'ez B in the reverse legend should be a Ge'ez H. Some slips in AC are perpetuated: for type 144 the reverse legend should be translated ¬Mercy (not Peace) to the people¼ ; for type 148-9 a Ge'ez Y is omitted from the reverse legend. Some references to the Juel-Jensen collection are incorrect: for type 57i J-J 382 should be 314 or 316; for type 66 J-J 300 should be 380.

There are more significant slips on the plates. 58 is not of type 39 (perhaps rather 42); 74 and 75 are transposed; obverse and reverse are transposed for 4,9, 27, 42,49, 70, 382 and many of the forgeries; many of the latest coins are wrongly orientated.

This is a handsomely produced, though slim, volume. It is expensive and general readers will get better value for money from AC. For the Aksumite specialist, however, this BM catalogue is a must, especially for its plates.

Vincent West

Magic coins of Java, Bali and the Malay Peninsula by Joe Cribb

288pp 80 plates with 464 coin illustrations and figures. London 1999,
ISBN 0 7141 0881 2 Published by the British Museum Press. Price: £75

More than 125 years have passed since the publication of Millies' catalogue of the coinage of the Indian Archipelago and Malayan Peninsula which included a substantial number of Javanese temple coins. In those 125 years only fragmentary numismatic documentation involving magic pieces was published. Therefore the publication of the present book is a modern milestone. The book contains a wealth of documentation not only of the pieces themselves, but also of their non-currency purpose and the background of the ceremonies, symbolism and mythological figures shown. The catalogue is based on the Raffles collection of coin-shaped charms from Java in the British Museum, supplemented with data from other sources. Raffles' activities emphasize plainly the lack of interest of the Dutch for Javanese history and culture during the preceding VOC administration that was devoted mainly to the pursuits of commerce. Only in 1847 did a Dutch publication appear mentioning Javanese temple-coins (gobogs).

The pieces are classified into 333 different types based on 1050 specimens and grouped within 19 series according to their likely date and place of production.

The catalogue is preceded by a number of introductory sections. These include:

1. Content and Arrangement,
2. Collections and Scholarship,
3. Classification and Designs,
4. Dating and Function.
5. Magic coins

The 4th section contains an interesting table on their metallic composition. This gives strong support to the idea that were made from melted down Chinese cash. After the catalogue and following the bibliography are two appendices. Appendix 1 lists the origin or whereabouts of the pieces; appendix 2 gives the translation of the various Arabic and Malay inscriptions. The two appendices are followed by three indexes: designs, design elements and general. There are 64 plates illustrating 464 specimens and 16 comparative plates with 48 figures.

I have only one major criticism that involves the production and popularity of use of the gobogs. The author mentions on several occasions the practice of imitating and the use of originals for the production of moulds as common practice. Together with the large section on their possible function, this would suggest a large scale production throughout the ages and a use by a large number of people.

The data on coin-finds as mentioned in the Minutes of the Batavian Society of Arts and Science (MBSAS) in the period 1864-1914, however, show that as compared to the amounts of Chinese cash and silver Hindu-pieces, the gobogs are generally found in small numbers. One exception is the find of 415 buried gobogs in 1893 near

Bagelen. Evidence for large scale production is found only from the beginning of the twentieth century and later. In 1903 the Dutch numismatist Van der Chys suspected the presence of a fabrication unit on the eastern part of Java, based on the frequent offers of brand-new gobogs.

It is a pity that the author does not comment on the gobog-finds referred to in the article by Robert Wicks (1986). In 1915 nearly 2500 pieces were found in the region of Kediri and very surprisingly according to the Dutch journal "Oudheidkundig Verslag" in 1940 more than 8500 gobogs were discovered. The largest finds of 2500 and 4561 pieces were in the regions of Tritikoelon and Banjoemas respectively.

A small number of minor criticisms can be made. The criteria for inclusion or exclusion of certain classes of pieces are not quite clear. For example, on the one hand one might argue against the inclusion of pieces like nos 282 or 283, since they do not bear figures and are far away from the Javanese-style pieces. On the other hand they fall within the definition of the term "Magic coin" as given on page 9. But then it is not clear why Chinese coin-shaped charms produced in Java or the Malay Peninsula, are not included.

For the sake of completeness and also to avoid the idea of neglecting non-British coin prototypes I would prefer to have seen mentioned on page 11 and illustrated in the comparative plates also Mexican/Spanish pieces from series 15 and the Chinese/Japanese pieces from series 17, Group 10. When looking at the semicircular arc of small stars present on some pieces like nos. 294 and 308, one might involuntarily think about a similar design on some US-trade dollars.

Some alternatives for the wedding idea should have been mentioned. In MBSAS XLVI, page 108/109 (1908), it has been suggested that the tree is not a waringi tree, but a coconut tree (jav. *klapa*) whose leaves (jav. *goen*) play an essential role in the Javanese way of spinning. The female figure has been regarded as the goddess of spinning. On page 75 the author comments on the use of kepengs on Bali before the twentieth century. Until as late as 1930 kepengs were still used as small money on the markets.

I am sure this book will revive the study of these long neglected items and will remain undoubtedly for long time the standard catalogue for them.

T.D. Yih